



300 S. IMPERIAL AVE., SUITE 6
EL CENTRO, CA 92243-2875
PHONE: (760) 337-4537

**IMPERIAL VALLEY RESOURCE MANAGEMENT AGENCY (IVRMA)
TECHNICAL ADVISORY COMMITTEE (TAC)**

MINUTES

April 27, 2023

Present

Quorum Attendees:

Abraham Campos	City of El Centro
Liz Zarate	City of El Centro
Frank Pacheco	City of El Centro
Jose Castañeda	Imperial County Public Works
Lily Falomir	City of Calexico
Nick Wells	City of Holtville

Attendees:

David Aguirre	IVRMA-ICTC
Maricela Galarza	IVRMA
Atenea Leal	IVRMA
Matt Gray	CR&R
Diego Torres	Imperial County Public Health Department
Craig Stroud	MINERVA Consultant

1. Mr. Campos called the meeting to order at 3:03 p.m. **A quorum was present.** Introductions were made.
 - Hybrid meeting
2. Minutes were reviewed for March 23, 2023, no comments or changes were requested. Minutes were adopted for March 23, 2023. (**Castañeda, Falomir**) **Motion Carried.**
3. EAR Reporting Software and Pricing.
 - Ms. Galarza introduced Craig Stroud, a representative for the Minerva recycling software platform.
 - Mr. Stroud provided a presentation and demonstration on Minerva's software recycling reporting platform. The software provides access to jurisdictions, JPA, and Haulers to insert or obtain information from the system. Minerva works directly with the Haulers to obtain residential and business accounts to develop accurate data for the EAR report. Mr. Stroud also mentioned presented the following concepts.
 - Cloud-based system
 - Differentiators of their platform to others
 - Q & A
 - Mr. Campos asked if there were other JPA's that the firm has worked with in Southern California.

- Mr. Stroud mentioned that they currently work with **MCRWMA** in Merced County.
 - Mr. Stroud offered jurisdictions a personalized demonstration of the software to provide a more comprehensive understanding of the Minerva platform.
 - Mr. Gray mentioned that Minerva is a platform used in San Diego County. He will reach out to obtain more information on how the software works for them.
 - Mr. Campos asked Mr. Stroud if Minerva has worked or is currently working with Republic Services since Imperial County has 2 major haulers that will be reporting.
 - Mr. Stroud responded, yes, currently the City of Placentia and Wittier have republic services. Mr. Stroud added that information gathered or that requires to be changed will have a fast turnover time in comparison to other software platforms. Minerva works to update any required changes, especially those that come from a hauler standpoint in an estimation of 30 minutes. The platform is set up where Minerva works directly with the haulers, therefore jurisdictions would not be involved in the collection of the data unless an issue needs to be addressed.
4. Software Firms Pricing Comparison.
- Ms. Galarza presented jurisdictions with both Recyclist Group and Minerva’s price proposals. The price proposals included prices for a one-year contract and a three-year contract. Both firms proposed a 10% discount if a three-year contract is created and implemented.
 - Ms. Galarza also mentioned that the references for Recyclist group were contacted, and the following information was concluded.
 - Additional resources were required to complete reporting at the end of the year.
 - Turnover for any major hauler information change would take approximately three months to complete.
 - Pricing is high, one reference was looking into other similar platforms to reevaluate the services and cost of the platform.
 - TAC members requested IVRMA to complete a Minerva reference check to discuss further during the upcoming meeting in May.
 - Ms. Galarza mentioned that she will complete the reference check that was included in Minerva’s proposal but will also contact Merced County per the jurisdictions’ request.
5. Glance at Membership Budget FY 2023-24.
- Ms. Galarza presented TAC members with a budget proposal that included various options as requested in April’s TAC meeting. The following options were included.

Based on a 1-year contract with software firms.

 - Option 1: Membership+Capacity Plan Project =\$450,000
 - Option 2: Membership+Capacity Plan+ Recyclist Group Software =\$514,890
 - Option 3: Membership+Capacity Plan+Minerva Software =\$509,500

Based on a 3-year contract with software firms.

 - Option 1: Membership+Capacity Plan Project =\$450,000
 - Option 2: Membership+Capacity Plan+ Recyclist Group Software =\$509,501
 - Option 3: Membership+Capacity Plan+Minerva Software=\$503,900
 - Ms. Galarza also presented TAC members with a breakdown costs that would be associated with

each jurisdiction. This was based on the three-year contract proposal from software firms.

- Mr. Castañeda asked if budget information would be forwarded to members, as some jurisdictions were not present at the meeting.
 - Ms. Galarza stated that all the information will be forwarded to TAC members after the meeting.
- TAC members discussed further the Capacity Plan project cost and the concept of it being a requirement for all jurisdiction participation.
- TAC members discussed further the benefits and costs associated with the pertaining software programs.
- Jurisdictions will present the proposed budget to their committees/boards for further discussion and approval.
 - Ms. Falomir requested that once the reference information is gathered, an impromptu meeting should be coordinated to finalize the budget option. This will allow the City of Calexico to add a proposed budget for the board review.

6. EAR Reporting Final Template Demonstration.

- Ms. Galarza presented TAC members with a final draft EAR Jurisdiction Reporting Template. A demonstration of the template features was presented. Ms. Galarza mentioned the template is final and will be forwarded to all jurisdictions for the collection of the fiscal year 2022-23 data. CalRecycle official deadline is the 1st of August, therefore jurisdictions will be asked to submit data by July 15, 2023, to provide IVRMA staff enough time to compile and enter data into the Calrecycle software system.
 - Mr. Pacheco stated that the section on Outreach and Education may be more than just IVRMA data. Other agencies are conducting outreach and education as well.
 - Comment Noted. Ms. Galarza stated that the template will be adjusted and any jurisdiction or hauler that has conducted outreach and education can add the data to the report template.

7. IVRMA updates.

Ms. Leal provided the following updates.

- IVRMA will be attending 8 events in the Imperial County Cities of Heber, Brawley, and El Centro. For May IVRMA will be hosting 2 clean-up events in the Cities of Niland, and the Salton Sea.
- Staff are currently working on providing non-waived businesses with an EFG letter providing them with information on the requirement for SB 1383. Staff are focusing on the cities of El Centro, Brawley, and Calexico. Still ongoing.
- Staff will also conduct a food waste presentation at Central Union High School. Staff is coordinated with Vanessa from the Calfresh Healthy Living Program.

8. Member Roundtable:

- Mr. Castañeda couldn't stress enough the importance of IVRMA providing the proposed budget to jurisdictions.
 - Ms. Galarza assured Mr. Castañeda that IVRMA will make it a priority to send all members the information as soon as possible.

9. General Discussion

- None

10. Adjournment

- Mr. Campos adjourned the meeting at 4:26 p.m.

- The next meeting will be held on Thursday, May 25, 2023, at the Imperial County Transportation Commission Office, 1503 N. Imperial Ave., Suite 104, El Centro, CA 92243.